



**SANTA CRUZ METROPOLITAN TRANSIT DISTRICT (METRO)  
BOARD OF DIRECTORS AGENDA MEETING MINUTES  
MAY 26, 2016 – 5:00PM  
WATSONVILLE CITY CHAMBERS  
275 MAIN STREET  
WATSONVILLE, CA 95076**

A regular meeting of the Board of Directors of the Santa Cruz Metropolitan Transit District (METRO) was convened on Friday, May 26, 2016 at the Watsonville City Chambers, 275 Main Street, Watsonville, CA

The Board Meeting Agenda Packet can be found online at [www.SCMTD.com](http://www.SCMTD.com) and is available for inspection at Santa Cruz Metro's Administrative offices at 110 Vernon Street, Santa Cruz, California.

This document has been created with accessibility in mind. With the exception certain 3rd party and other attachments, it passes the Adobe Acrobat XI Accessibility Full Check. If you have any questions about the accessibility of this document, please email your inquiry to [accessibility@scmttd.com](mailto:accessibility@scmttd.com)

**1 CALL TO ORDER at 5:09 PM by Chair Rotkin.**

**2 ROLL CALL: The following Directors were present, representing quorum:**

<b>Director Ed Bottorff</b>	<b>City of Capitola</b>	
<b>Director Dene Bustichi</b>	<b>City of Scotts Valley</b>	<b>AR 5:11P</b>
<b>Director Karina Cervantez</b>	<b>City of Watsonville</b>	
<b>Director Cynthia Chase</b>	<b>City of Santa Cruz</b>	
<b>Director Jimmy Dutra, Vice Chair</b>	<b>City of Watsonville</b>	<b>AR 5:24P</b>
<b>Director Norm Hagen</b>	<b>County of Santa Cruz</b>	
<b>Director Don Lane</b>	<b>City of Santa Cruz</b>	
<b>Director John Leopold</b>	<b>County of Santa Cruz</b>	<b>AR 5:11P</b>
<b>Director Mike Rotkin, Chair</b>	<b>County of Santa Cruz</b>	
<b>Ex-Officio Director Donna Blitzer</b>	<b>UC Santa Cruz</b>	

The following Directors were absent:

Director Zach Friend	County of Santa Cruz
Director Bruce McPherson	County of Santa Cruz

**STAFF PRESENT:**

Alex Clifford	METRO CEO/General Manager
Leslyn K. Syren	METRO District Counsel

**METRO EMPLOYEES AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WHO VOLUNTARILY INDICATED THEY WERE PRESENT (IN ALPHABETICAL ORDER) WERE:**

Heather Adamson, AMBAG  
Angela Aitken, METRO  
Emmanuel Balestero, Brown Berets  
David Matute Chavarria, Independent  
Marty Davis  
Jason Gabriel, Brown Berets  
Guadalupe Guizar  
Maria R. Guzman

Leigh Liles, Citizen  
Patricia Lohrman, City of Watsonville  
Pat Malo, Community Member  
Roy Rogers, Cabrillo Student  
Frances Salgado  
Susan Sanford, Self, Seniors, Disabled  
Suzanne Silva, METRO  
Dan Stevenson, Drivers

## **SECTION I: OPEN SESSION**

### **3 ANNOUNCEMENTS**

Mike asked those with signs to please be aware of anyone behind them so as to not block the view of others in the audience.

Chair Rotkin introduced Carlos Landaverry and his Spanish Language Interpretation services and announced Community Television of Santa Cruz County is televising this meeting on Channel 26. Community Television's technician today is Mike Oliphant.

Chair Rotkin went on to say that today's meeting includes the public hearing regarding proposed services changes (Item 9 on today's agenda). We will open this public hearing at today's meeting and continue it tomorrow morning at the Santa Cruz City Chambers, located at 809 Center Street, Santa Cruz. Tomorrow's meeting will begin with a Closed Session at 8:00AM, to be followed by the continued public hearing at 8:30AM or as soon thereafter as possible.

Comment cards are available at the back of the room. Due to the smaller audience, we anticipate allowing each speaker 3 minutes; this may be modified if the audience increases substantially.

At the back of the room, and at each Board Member's seat, are copies of the proposed service changes and maps that are being considered during the hearing. Prior to hearing comments on these proposed changes, we have several additional handouts that are available for review by the public and have been posted on the District's website over the past month. Angela Aitken, Finance Manager, will begin the presentation with a brief budget update. She will be followed by Barrow Emerson, Planning and Development Manager who will provide an update to the Comprehensive Operational Analysis (COA).

Director Bottorff will be leaving tonight's meeting early (approximately 5:30PM) to attend Capitola's City Council meeting.

### **4 BOARD OF DIRECTORS COMMENTS**

None.

### **5 COMMUNICATIONS TO THE BOARD OF DIRECTORS**

In response to requests for public comment:

Brian Peoples, TrailNow.org, has met with the SCCRTC regarding the upcoming tax initiative and is attempting to educate the public as to how the funds would be allocated. They are hopeful that this tax measure can be adjusted to divert funds to buses and to better fit METRO goals. They believe more money is being allocated to the train than required and that a separate transit agency may be created for the train. On behalf of Dr. Rob Quinn, Physicians Medical Group's President, he stressed how important it is to have a transit system for those who don't have a car or are unable to drive. He asked that the public work as a team to better serve our community.

Dan Stevenson, METRO Bus Operator, said the proposed tax measure must be articulated in a way that makes sense to the voters.

## **6 WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS FROM MAC**

Chair Rotkin referred the audience to the May 18, 2016 Comments on COA, Proposed Service Changes.

Michael Pisano, MAC Member, spoke on behalf of MAC's Chair, Veronica Elsea. He thanked Barrow and his team for the updates they've provided to MAC and the public. He said the public wants access to clinics, schools, grocery stores, etc. with increased connection and transfer times. Mid-day service reductions would affect the senior and disabled community. He requested upgraded bus shelters, turn-by-turn directions, new ParaCruz vehicles and additional training for Customer Service staff on any new routing.

## **7 LABOR ORGANIZATION COMMUNICATIONS**

Eduardo Montesino, UTU representative, asked the Board to reconsider asking speakers to state their names and discontinue the use of security at the meeting as it may be construed as intimidation; be more aware of the impact and messages to the community. The service cuts will result in fewer Operators which will mean extended wait times and more passengers in the Paratransit bus for longer periods. Additionally, the employees are feeling anxious.

## **8 ADDITIONAL DOCUMENTATION TO SUPPORT EXISTING AGENDA ITEMS**

Chair Rotkin announced the following items were distributed to Board Members and are available at the back of the room for public viewing:

- Item 9: Information to accompany the Public Hearing:
  - FY17 & FY18 Operating Budget and FY17 Capital Budget (duplicate of the 5/13/16 Board Presentation)
  - Weekday, Weekend Proposals and Maps
  - COA (Comprehensive Operational Analysis):
    - Public Comments Received as of 5/14/16 (Details the source and nature of the comment)
    - Public Comments by Route as of 5/14/16
    - Public Comment Themes as of 5/14/16 (Summation of the two aforementioned documents)
    - Watsonville Health Facilities to be Served by METRO Routes
- News Clips: Media articles of interest

## **9 PUBLIC HEARING REGARDING PROPOSED SERVICE REDUCTION**

As very few comment cards were submitted, Chair Rotkin asked those who wish to speak to line up at the appropriate time.

He added that the Board wants to ensure that none of the public are disenfranchised throughout the process; we want to make systematic changes and ensure the public is aware of what is happening. He reiterated that this meeting will continue to tomorrow at the Santa Cruz City Chambers beginning with a closed session at 8:00AM and the public hearing continuing at 8:30AM or as soon thereafter as possible. It is possible to make adjustments up to the June 24, 2016 meeting.

Maps and proposed service changes are on the back table and have been constantly updated on the SCMETROForward.com website. As such, the public was asked to please limit his/her comments to the present proposal as there have been several iterations.

Finance Manager Aitken's presentation will be similar to that presented at the May 13, 2016 Board Meeting.

*Director Bottorff departed at 5:36PM.*

Director Leopold asked if the Cabrillo “number” would be known before the budget is presented at the June 24, 2016 Board Meeting. Ms. Aitken responded that METRO is hoping to present revenue information for Cabrillo, UCSC and VTA at the June 24 Board Meeting. A revised budget will be presented in November 2016.

In response to Director Leopold’s request for an STA funding update, CEO Clifford said Governor Brown’s revised budget resulted in a negative impact to METRO of approximately \$800K due to lower diesel sales tax revenues. However, there is optimism tied to Senator Beall’s bill, X11, which is proposing an increase to the diesel fuel tax. If this passes, it has the potential to triple our STA allotment. Additionally, if the trailer bill is successful, we could see a reversion to the previous methodology for the last two quarters of the year (only) which would provide a return of approximately \$300K. He cautioned that the overall fund is being shared by a greater number of agencies.

Director Leopold stressed the importance of providing the community with a clear sense of service changes. CEO Clifford agreed and said we want to avoid a scenario of pulling and replacing service within a short timeframe. He added that the public process is seeking Board guidance, not a final decision today. Between tomorrow and June 24<sup>th</sup> we can look at the service changes and still balance the budget.

Chair Rotkin said we want to be specific about anticipated revenues; i.e., UCSC revenue will be utilized to carry UCSC students and Cabrillo revenue will result in mid-county service which serves their student population. Unfortunately, we don’t know the specifics until the respective institutions provide that information.

CEO Clifford noted that METRO is attempting to minimally impact the UCSC service, the Cabrillo students place a high value on the Route 91X and VTA revenues may result in minor thinning along the Highway 17 route(s).

Barrow Emerson, Planning and Development Manager, noted that today’s presentation has been significantly modified since March and does not include any reference to UCSC or Cabrillo. Priority has been given to coverage over frequency and span of service with available resources. All comments received to date are available at the [SCMETROForward.com](http://SCMETROForward.com) website and at the back of the room. 150 people attended the nine Open Houses from May 2 – 16, 2016. The most common concerns voiced were:

- Reinstatement of Route 91X
- Maintain current frequency for Route 71
- Maintain frequency of Route 69A (Mid-day)
- Retain service past Diridon Station
- Retain frequent San Lorenzo Valley (SLV) service

Comments heard over these two days will be incorporated in the June 24, 2016 proposal along with the Title VI analysis. We continue to meet with Cabrillo and UCSC. We are not planning any reductions to ParaCruz at this time nor are we making any assumptions about the November sales tax initiative.

Director Dutra thanked Mr. Emerson and his team for the hard work; it looks dramatically different from that presented in March. This reflects the importance of passing the sales tax initiative in November. We need to become a self-help community. We heard this frequently during our recent trip to Washington, D.C.

Chair Rotkin opened the floor to public comment and reminded the speakers that they each had three minutes to speak.

The public comment transcript is available upon request from METRO's Administrative offices at 110 Vernon Street, Santa Cruz, CA 95060.

Hearing no other public speakers, Chair Rotkin thanked everyone for speaking in a courteous manner. He also reminded everyone that this is one meeting spread over two days and that the hearing would continue tomorrow at the Santa Cruz City Chambers at 8:30AM or as soon thereafter as possible. The Board will respond to comments heard during today's meeting. The final decision will not be made today or tomorrow; emails and input will be received up to June 24, 2016.

Director Leopold thanked everyone for attending and said the Board is listening to the testimony provided through the public process; they are trying to make changes with the least amount of impact while looking for other funding sources. The largest pool of funds appears to be through the successful passing of the sales tax initiative, which could provide as much as \$2.2M to METRO.

Director Hagen said the Board understands the absolute need and critical nature of the bus to the community.

### **REVIEW OF ITEMS TO BE DISCUSSED IN CLOSED SESSION**

Leslyn K. Syren, District Counsel, announced that the Personnel Matter – CEO/General Manager Performance Review (Government Code Section 54957(b)) will be discussed in closed session tomorrow, May 27, 2016 at 8:00AM at the Santa Cruz City Chambers, 809 Center Street, Santa Cruz, CA.

Chair Rotkin recessed the meeting at 7:15PM to continue at 8:30AM or as soon thereafter as possible at the Santa Cruz City Chambers, 809 Center Street, Santa Cruz, CA.

**MAY 27, 2016 – 8:00AM  
SANTA CRUZ CITY CHAMBERS  
809 CENTER STREET  
SANTA CRUZ, CA 95060**

**SECTION II: CLOSED SESSION**

- 10 PERSONNEL MATTER – CEO/GENERAL MANAGER PERFORMANCE REVIEW  
(Government Code Section 54957(b))**

**SECTION III: RECONVENE OPEN SESSION**

NOTE: THE BOARD CHAIR MAY TAKE ITEMS OUT OF ORDER

- 11** Chair Rotkin called the meeting to order at 8:33AM on Friday, May 27, 2016, at the Santa Cruz City Chambers, 809 Center Street, Santa Cruz, CA

- 12 ROLL CALL: The following Directors were present, representing quorum:**

Director Ed Bottorff	City of Capitola	
Director Dene Bustichi	City of Scotts Valley	
Director Karina Cervantez	City of Watsonville	
Director Cynthia Chase	City of Santa Cruz	
Director Jimmy Dutra, Vice Chair	City of Watsonville	AR 9:20AM
Director Norm Hagen	County of Santa Cruz	
Director Don Lane	City of Santa Cruz	
Director John Leopold	County of Santa Cruz	
Director Mike Rotkin, Chair	County of Santa Cruz	
Ex-Officio Director Donna Blitzer	UC Santa Cruz	AR 8:35AM

No Directors were absent.

**STAFF PRESENT:**

Alex Clifford  
Leslyn K. Syren

METRO CEO/General Manager  
METRO District Counsel

**METRO EMPLOYEES AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WHO VOLUNTARILY INDICATED THEY WERE PRESENT (IN ALPHABETICAL ORDER) WERE:**

Heather Adamson, AMBAG  
Angela Aitken, Santa Cruz METRO  
Julia Butterfield, Self, Transit Rider  
Elise Casby, Bus Rider's Association  
Jane F. Gallagher, Self  
Carl Hiller  
Debbie Kinslow, SCMTD

Brenda Malphrus, SMART  
Bonnie Morr, SMART  
Jack Nelson, Campaign for Sensible  
Transportation  
Daniel Zaragoza, Santa Cruz  
METRO

Chair Rotkin recessed the meeting at 9:10AM to fix an audio issue.

The meeting was reconvened at 9:25AM

**13 ANNOUNCEMENTS**

Chair Rotkin introduced Carlos Landaverry and his Spanish Language Interpretation services and announced Community Television of Santa Cruz County is televising today's meeting on Channel 26. Community Television's technician today is Victor Herrmann.

Chair Rotkin went on to say that today's meeting includes the public hearing regarding proposed services changes (Item 21 on today's agenda).

Chair Rotkin provided a written report highlighting the recent Washington, DC trip undertaken by himself, Director McPherson, Director Dutra and CEO Clifford. (See attached.)

Director Chase will be leaving today's meeting at approximately 11:00AM to handle job responsibilities.

**14 REPORT FROM CLOSED SESSION**

Chair Rotkin reported that the Board met in a Closed Session this morning at 8:00AM regarding the CEO/General Manager Performance Review. The Board is pleased with Mr. Clifford's performance. Additionally, CEO Clifford declined any step increase in light of METRO's current fiscal situation.

**15 COMMUNICATIONS TO THE BOARD OF DIRECTORS**

- Written Communication from TrailNow.org

**16 WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS FROM MAC**

- May 18, 2016 Comments on COA, Proposed Service Changes

**17 LABOR ORGANIZATION COMMUNICATIONS**

**18 ADDITIONAL DOCUMENTATION TO SUPPORT EXISTING AGENDA ITEMS**

Chair Rotkin announced copies of the proposed service changes and maps that are being considered during the hearing are available at the back of the room, at each Board Member's seat and have been posted on the District's website over the past month.

Angela Aitken, Finance Manager, will begin the presentation with a brief budget update. Barrow Emerson, Planning and Development Manager, will provide an update to the Comprehensive Operational Analysis (COA).

## **CONSENT AGENDA**

All items appearing on the Consent Agenda are recommended actions which are considered to be routine and will be acted upon as one motion. All items removed will be considered later in the agenda. The Board Chair will allow public input prior to the approval of the Consent Agenda items.

### **19-01 RECOMMENDED ACTION ON TORT CLAIMS**

**19-02 ACCEPT AND FILE THE YEAR TO DATE MONTHLY FINANCIAL REPORT AS OF FEBRUARY 29, 2016**

**19-03 ACCEPT AND FILE MINUTES OF THE SANTA CRUZ METRO BOARD OF DIRECTORS MEETING OF MAY 13, 2016**

**19-04 ACCEPT AND FILE: MINUTES OF THE MAC MEETING OF APRIL 20, 2016**

**19-05 ACCEPT AND FILE: METRO SYSTEM RIDERSHIP REPORTS FOR THE THIRD QUARTER OF FY16**

**19-06 ACCEPT AND FILE: THE METRO PARACRUZ OPERATIONS STATUS REPORT FOR JANUARY, FEBRUARY AND MARCH 2016**

**19-07 ACCEPT AND FILE: CONSIDERATION OF METROBASE MONTHLY CHANGE ORDER REPORT**

**19-08 ACCEPT AND FILE: SEMI-ANNUAL REPORT ON THE STATUS OF METRO'S DISADVANTAGED BUSINESS ENTERPRISE PROGRAM (OCT – MAR)**

**19-09 APPROVE: CONSIDERATION OF ISSUING A FORMAL INVITATION FOR BIDS FOR HVAC MAINTENANCE SERVICES**

**19-10 APPROVE CONSIDERATION OF ISSUING A FORMAL INVITATION FOR BIDS FOR PURCHASE AND INSTALLATION OF CHAIN-LINK FENCING AND GATES**

**19-11 APPROVE: CONSIDER ADOPTING A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE CEO/GENERAL MANAGER TO SUBMIT APPLICATIONS AND EXECUTE AGREEMENTS TO RECEIVE FUNDS FOR THE FY17 MOTOR VEHICLE EMISSION REDUCTION GRANT PROGRAM**

**19-12 APPROVE: CONSIDER AUTHORIZING THE CEO/GENERAL MANAGER TO EXECUTE A LETTER OF INTENT TO MAINTAIN BUS STOP FACILITIES AT SAN LORENZO VALLEY HIGH SCHOOL TO BE CONSTRUCTED BY THE COUNTY**

**ACTION: MOTION TO APPROVE THE CONSENT AGENDA AS PRESENTED**

**MOTION: DIRECTOR LANE**

**SECOND: DIRECTOR McPHERSON**

**MOTION PASSED WITH 10 AYES (Directors Bottorff, Bustichi, Cervantez, Chase, Friend, Hagen, Lane, Leopold, McPherson and Rotkin.) Director Dutra was absent.**

*Director Dutra arrived at 9:20AM*

## REGULAR AGENDA

### 20 RESOLUTIONS OF APPRECIATION FOR MARIA GRANADOS-BOYCE, ANDREA HERSHEY, JUAN SERRATO AND RUBEN VALDEZ

Chair Rotkin recognized and expressed the appreciation of the Board and METRO to those employees below who were not in attendance to be recognized for their dedication and efforts:

- Maria Granados-Boyce, Transit Supervisor (35 years of service with METRO)
- Andrea Hershey, Bus Operator (8 years of service with METRO)
- Juan Serrato, Bus Operator (16 years of service with METRO)
- Ruben Valdez, Bus Operator (10 years of service with METRO)

**ACTION: MOTION TO APPROVE THE RESOLUTIONS OF APPRECIATION AS PRESENTED**

**MOTION: DIRECTOR LEOPOLD**

**SECOND: DIRECTOR LANE**

**MOTION PASSED WITH 11 AYES (Directors Bottorff, Bustichi, Cervantez, Chase, Dutra, Friend, Hagen, Lane, Leopold, McPherson and Rotkin)**

### 21 PUBLIC HEARING CONTINUED REGARDING PROPOSED SERVICE REDUCTION

Chair Rotkin opened the public hearing at 9:35AM and reminded the speakers that they each had three minutes to speak. Those interested in speaking were asked to line up along the wall. Names would be appreciated, but are not required. He emphasized that no decisions will be made today. Comments specific to routes, geography and trip purpose are most helpful.

Barrow Emerson, Planning and Development Manager, thanked Eduardo Montesino, Andrea Eusse-Gill and the team for their efforts and contributions. The proposal before us today has changed significantly from that presented on March 25<sup>th</sup> and the baseline achieves our savings targets. The COA Ad Hoc Committee has confirmed the priority to accomplish service-wide coverage over frequency, no changes will be made to ParaCruz at this time and no assumptions are being made about the November sales tax initiative. METRO will continue to review all public comments until June 24, 2016.

150 people attended 9 Open Houses over 10 days. The majority of the concerns involved routes and METRO's financial situation.

The public comment transcript is available upon request from METRO's Administrative offices at 110 Vernon Street, Santa Cruz, CA 95060.

Hearing no other public speakers, Chair Rotkin thanked everyone for speaking and noted that the Board has received significant input which has been very helpful.

Chair Rotkin continued: Approximately 23% of METRO's funding comes from the fare box revenue which is higher than the national average; yet, this is not enough to fund our services. We need to locate additional subsidies. Advertising on the bus stops is a City decision; not a METRO one. Our reserves are now at a level where we are unable to 'match' grant funds. Public support for the sales tax measure in November would be greatly appreciated as it represents a potential influx of \$2.2M for METRO.

*Director Chase departed at 11:03AM*



Director Leopold clarified that the previous METRO Board did cut routes and raise fares but did not anticipate the length of the recession. There are two bills in the legislature currently that could provide financial support for METRO and other transit agencies; unfortunately, they require a 2/3 vote to be successful. He supports an ongoing dialogue with both UCSC and Cabrillo to best serve the needs of the community.

Director Lane thanked everyone for their comments. He noted the overlap between SCCRTC and METRO has resulted in some dividends; e.g., the first draft of the sales tax initiative allocated 13.5% to METRO. With the intervention and encouragement of several Board members, this was raised to 15%.

**ACTION: MOTION TO CONTINUE THE PUBLIC HEARING TO THE JUNE 24, 2016 METRO BOARD MEETING. STAFF TO RETURN WITH TWO SCENARIOS, BOTH WHICH INCLUDE A TITLE VI ANALYSIS:**

**SCENARIO 1: SERVICES CUTS IF THE NOVEMBER 2016 SALES TAX MEASURE DOES NOT PASS; I.E., DEPICTING \$6.5M IN CUTS MINUS KNOWN FUNDING**

**SCENARIO 2: SERVICE CUTS IF THE NOVEMBER 2016 SALES TAX MEASURE DOES PASS**

**MOTION: DIRECTOR LEOPOLD**

**SECOND: DIRECTOR LANE**

**MOTION PASSED WITH 10 AYES (Directors Bottorff, Bustichi, Cervantez, Dutra, Friend, Hagen, Lane, Leopold, McPherson and Rotkin) Director Chase was absent.**

**22 REVIEW OF ITEMS TO BE DISCUSSED IN CLOSED SESSION**

Leslyn Syren, District Counsel, announced the following item to be discussed in Closed Session and added that no announcement would follow.

**CONFERENCE WITH LABOR NEGOTIATOR**

(Government Code Section 54957.6)

Agency Negotiators: Alex Clifford, CEO/General Manager  
Leslyn K. Syren, District Counsel  
Suzanne Silva, Assistant Human Resources Manager

Employee Organization: United Transportation Union (UTU) Local 23, Fixed Route  
United Transportation Union (UTU) Local 23, ParaCruz  
Service Employees International Union (SEIU), Local 521

**23 ANNOUNCEMENT OF NEXT MEETING: FRIDAY, JUNE 24, 2016 AT 8:30AM, SANTA CRUZ CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS, 809 CENTER STREET, SANTA CRUZ**

Chair Rotkin announced the next meeting as above.

**26 ADJOURNMENT**

Chair Rotkin adjourned at 11:10AM.

Respectfully submitted,

Gina Pye  
Executive Assistant